Joburg Carnival and the Potential for Social Cohesion and Therapeutic Activism

Courtnay Micots
Florida A & M University
E-mail: courtnay.micots@famu.edu

City-funded and managed since 2004, the Joburg Carnival is an annual street parade with costumed performers, sound trucks and decorative floats meandering through the inner city of Johannesburg on New Year’s Eve. Initiated by the City government, the parade was meant to eliminate inner-city violence and create social cohesion. Although popular at first, carnival participation and attendance has waned considerably. This paper will examine how the City has inadvertently suppressed the most essential ingredient in a carnival – the carnivalesque. Theories about the carnivalesque from Mikhail Bakhtin and theatre in the streets by the oppressed from Augusto Boal inform this study. The most engaging carnivals involve the local communities who use carnival as a tool to voice their concerns in carnivalesque ways that activate both participants and spectators as a therapeutic form of activism. With its limits on carnivalesque expression, the Joburg carnivals have operated more as parades than providing a form of social cohesion and therapy to the inner-city.

Keywords: carnival, masquerade, performance, theatre, resistance

“Embarrassing” is how Zoleka Ntabeni, currently the Manager: Public Culture – Arts, Culture & Heritage in the Community Development Department, described the 2014 Joburg Carnival.1 Since conception the carnival in Johannesburg has included youth groups from all seven regions of the Gauteng province, yet in 2014, only four groups from two regions participated (figure 1). This condensed event led many to speculate that the Joburg Carnival was finished. However, in 2015 the carnival occurred, though at the same reduced size. While a parade is a public procession, usually to celebrate a holiday or event, a carnival is a parade that includes elements of what Russian philosopher Mikhail Bakhtin termed the carnivalesque, which practiced in popular culture overturns sociopolitical and religious so-called truths. Therefore, men become women, fools become wise, beggars become kings, and the figures of heaven and hell, specifically angels and devils, intermingle. (Bahktin 1984: 11,15) Since the name of the event is “Joburg Carnival,” a carnival is expected. This paper will examine the reasons behind its perceived lack of success. Although the City administration is well-intentioned, they inadvertently suppress the most essential ingredient in a carnival – the carnivalesque.

As an art historian specializing in African art, I conducted the research for this article while fulfilling an Andrew W. Mellon Postdoctoral Fellowship at the Wits Art Museum from August

88
2014 to May 2015. Informed by carnival and resistance arts in southern Ghana, the subject of my previous work, the enthusiasm of the artists and organizers and the lack of previous scholarship on black carnivals in Johannesburg captured my attention. Thus, my fieldwork utilized an emic approach, interviewing a variety of artists, performers, organizers and spectators. (McEvilley 1996: 110-112) It is my hope that future scholars will continue to critique this carnival with other perspectives and in contrast to carnivals abroad.

Carnivals are critical sites where the meanings of inclusion, power, freedom, and the opportunity to voice rights are contested and negotiated within or against the frameworks of beliefs, protocols and conventions. Carnival and theatre are merged in street parades mainly organized and performed by black residents in Johannesburg as performative acts that engage with, contest, and honor heritage. Theatre as the passionate enactment of social interrelations conveys all manner of emotive responses, including conflict, confrontation and resistance. Augusto Boal, Brazilian theatre director and activist, has written extensively about theatre in the streets as a performance conducted by the oppressed to empower participants and spectators as a therapeutic form of activism. (Boal 1985: 122) Thus, when inner city black carnivals began to appear in Johannesburg the mid-1990s, they allowed the drama of the stage to find space in the streets as a means to attach both actors and spectators “to actions in which the characters have an investment, situations in which they venture their lives and their feelings, their moral and their political choices.” (Boal 1995: 29)

**Annual Children’s Creativity Pageant**

A history of almost 100 years of inner-city street parades exists wherein their purpose and longevity parallel country and city politics. Although most parades held in the post-Apartheid era were short-lived events, the organizers and artists, many with theatre backgrounds, unify these carnivals through their continued participation. Each of these events exhibits the bureaucratic tensions between governmental policies and popular culture. Two key developers of these carnivals are Benjy Francis and Kamal El Imam El Alaouï. Francis first moved black theatre into the streets in 1994 with the Annual Children’s Creativity Pageant hosted by the Afrika Cultural Centre (ACC), a facility for township youth (ages 7 to 35) to engage with the
arts. This pageant, or carnival, was held annually on the first Saturday of September, heritage month, and was inspired by the tragic events known as The Soweto Uprising of 1976, when about 20,000 high school students filled the township streets to lead a peaceful singing protest against the introduction of Afrikaans instruction. Police shot into the procession, killing a number of students and causing panic as everyone struggled to flee the scene. The first murdered student was 13-year-old Hector Pieterson. Pieterson became the symbol of the uprising and apartheid resistance due in part to an iconic news photograph of Pieterson being carried by fellow student Mbuyisa Makhubo which circulated in national and international papers. In the first ACC pageant, sculptures displayed on a float translated the famous photograph of Pieterson carried by Makhubo alongside the head and torso of Nelson Mandela (figure 2). Recycled wire, string and canvas sacks found in industrial waste bins were used to construct the oversized figures. Sacks covered a wire armature and were painted using automotive paint guns. Painted details were added using brushes. According to Francis, the carnival allowed “young people to express their experience of history. Carnival was almost a cathartic experience that enabled, even before the Truth and Reconciliation Commission was conceived, youth to express their histories and desires of freedom.” This artistic visualization of memory created a carnivalesque and therapeutic moment. Through the creation of these images the performers and spectators were able to reinvent the past and penetrate the future. According to Boal, “Therein resides the immense power with which theatre is endowed.” (Boal 1998: 7)

The ACC housed a children’s museum and a Centre for African Arts, where artists trained to become art educators and free workshops were provided to students. Numerous people worked at the ACC and assisted with the pageants. Clifford Charles, who is Francis’s nephew and has a Fine Arts degree from the University of the Witwatersrand (Wits), joined the team while he was a student and later ran the ACC’s Arts department until 1995. Lucas Matome specialized in large found-object sculptures and is credited with designing the Pieterson float. Choreographers Speek, Mfanelo Jacobs and Prince Massiham were involved with theatre and lent their talents to the carnival. English artist Ali Pretty, the artistic director of Kinetika, taught fabric painting, and her student Connie Sedumedi excelled. Sedumedi also facilitated the children’s programme. Oupa Bodibe joined the ACC in 1997, where he was introduced to dance and fine arts. By 2001, he was helping to create floats and paper mâché figures for the pageants. According to Francis, “Culture and development became the shell under which was the liberation movement.” Most of these artists have since participated in other inner-city and South African carnivals, including the Joburg Carnivals.
Choreography mixed older and contemporary moves. Music was created through drums and other percussion instruments. Acrobats and stilt walkers joined. John Moltemo, a.k.a. John J., is a stilt walker who performed in the pageants and trained others at the ACC to manage five-foot-high stilts. He also participated in an ACC exchange programme to Bordeaux, France, to attend a costume-making workshop as part of their annual carnival. Carnival encourages a desire to connect with the global; performing and training internationally is a dream, sometimes realized, among many of the performers.

To aid in the planning and management of the ACC carnivals, Francis hired El Alaoui as Carnival Director. El Alaoui has a theatre background and experience with puppetry, costumes and floats from the Notting Hill Carnival in London. The ACC pageants and other city carnival events in the 1990s and early 2000s become a visual avenue to demonstrate liberation from Apartheid, exemplifying Boal’s statement that “Theatre can also be a weapon for liberation.” (Boal 1985: ix) Francis used whatever was donated or found locally. Early costumes were constructed entirely from recycled materials, such as cardboard and newspaper (figure 3). One group from Westbury made their costumes from plastic city trash bin bags. Fringe was cut at the bottom of shirtsleeves, skirts and trousers. A scarf-like headdress was also crafted from the bags. Small jingle bells were worn around the ankles and wrists to create sound as the performer danced. The style of the costume derived from traditional forms of dress, but materials were modern. As diaspora theatre specialist Awam Amkpa has noted, “Postcolonial desires begin at the very moment in which the subordinated understand their subjugation and launch strategies of defiance and change.” (Amkpa 2006: 167) Refashioning the modern materials empowers the lower classes in remaking and retaking the urban environment as an expression of their liberation.

Dressing up in costume may also be understood as a strategy for change. These performances are liminal, crossing over two worlds – the real and imagined – and act as a cathartic process involving contrasts and complexities. The act of “dressing up” implies a form recognized as different from everyday attire and marks the occasion as special. Combined with other aspects of performance, a transformation is at hand. According to art historian Pamela R. Franco, "‘Dressing Up’ is a nonconfrontational style of masquerading that allows the performer to be visible as agents and producers of meaning in their carnival performances.” (Franco 1998: 23).
63) These inversions of the everyday empower both performer and spectator. Costumes may also represent a hidden desire, especially for peripheral figures of the Johannesburg social world, to conform or confront. For example, grotesque creations may express how the outsider feels they appear to local residents and police, opening a space to make visible this stereotype.

As the ACC carnivals progressed, bigger and better costumes were created, and the route changed. The pageants were held annually until 2003, when the event was merged with the Africa Day carnival. El Alaoui left his position at the ACC in 1998 to organize other carnivals. As part of the Ngoma Project, he directed a carnival in Durban honouring Queen Elizabeth II and Nelson Mandela in 1995, and Grahamstown in June 1995. He worked on Step Africa carnivals in Soweto starting in 1997.

One-Time Government-sponsored Parades

El Alaoui has become a major artistic and organizational force in government-sponsored South African carnivals that have a history of targeting social cohesion and education. He stated that he was challenged with promoting government-sponsored events such as parades and “not a protest march.” Therefore, the government who hired El Alaoui was specifically curbing the carnivalesque aspects that they interpreted as a precursor to violence. He organized carnivals for the Department of Justice in 1997, as a means to create awareness of the Bill of Rights passed in 1996. He worked with Wits academics to convert some articles from the Bill of Rights into common language, and then he worked with local artists to translate them into artistic expressions in performances and visual arts. El Alaoui’s carnival organized for the Department of Health in 1998, was used to create awareness around HIV/AIDS. In 1999, he was asked to create a carnival to celebrate the All-Africa Games held in September. He developed a team of artists from the crew at ACC, including Francis. According to El Alaoui, artists are constrained in government-sponsored carnivals because themes have to be generic and politically correct. These restrictions are responsible for the taming of the carnivalesque, and the public’s reaction along with it.

In 1998, El Alaoui met Stephen Sack, Chief Director at the National Department of Arts and Culture from 1997 to 2004. Shortly after, Sack advised Ben Ngubane, Minister of Arts, Culture, Science and Technology, to consider using carnival as a tool to build tourism and social cohesion. Later split into two divisions, Arts and Culture was renamed the Department of Arts, Culture and Heritage (DACH) and positioned under Community Development. Sack asked El Alaoui and Jacob “Jackie” Mbuyisela Semela, to create a pilot carnival in Morgan’s Bay, Eastern Cape, in 1999. After the carnival’s success, El Alaoui and Sack worked together to draft a National Carnival Policy, a strategy to establish carnival as an art form in South Africa to develop social cohesion, training and accreditation for the artists. It was abandoned by the government due to funding needs. In 2000, El Alaoui worked on carnivals for Step Africa and Pretoria. Around the same time, Sack was working to create an arts corridor, connecting the inner city areas of Hillbrow, Braamfontein, Newtown and Bertram. It also failed to gain government approval. Francois Venter, one of the founders and organizers of Creative Inner City Initiative (CICI), worked with Avril Joffe, a faculty member in Heritage Studies at Wits, who wrote a carnival policy in the early 2000s; it was also rejected. Alba Letts, former Head, Arts and Culture, wrote a proposal in 2011 for the department to manage the carnival infrastructure using half of the City funding and then give the regions the other half as seed money to encourage community involvement and creativity; she received no response from her superiors. She felt
this happened because “people are scared to take the next step; [they] feel communities aren’t ready yet.” Thus, even in 2011, the City was stifling the carnivalesque potential by disallowing greater community ownership.

The Education department for Gauteng Province hired El Alaoui to produce a carnival to celebrate Africa Day in November 2003 (figure 4). His directive for the carnival was to educate and create an appreciation for other African cultures in order to diminish xenophobic violence. El Alaoui patterned the event after a low-budget parade he worked on in Yeoville in 1998. The Yeoville parade included representations of different African cultures found within the area. The route wound through Yeoville streets, ending with performances on stage in the park. Notables, such as the late Anti-Apartheid Afropop singer Brenda Fassie, attended. A group of drummers from Senegal appeared. The one-time parade of children and adults was well-attended, yet El Alaoui felt the parade had little impact on xenophobia. In his attempt to create a more effective carnival for Africa Day, El Alaoui initiated a larger series of programs, including the carnival, with 54 Gauteng schools. For the carnival, each troupe was asked to represent an African country by creating costumes inspired by images of distinctive vegetation, animals or dress from their chosen country (figure 5). Over 5,000 participants, including several floats and stilt walkers, paraded throughout Hillbrow, Yeoville, Berea, Bertram and Newtown on a looped route. Participants performed in the afternoon on a stage in Mary Fitzgerald Square. The peaceful event attracted a racially-mixed crowd and received positive media coverage. Africa Day was a theatrical spectacle relating closely to Boal’s theories of heritage celebrated through an imagined reality and future. Despite a general feeling of success, effectiveness in meeting the City’s goals was difficult to measure.

In her Master’s dissertation for a degree in Dramatic Arts at Wits, Grace Meadows argues that the March against Xenophobia in May 2008 was lived as activist theatre. Participants marched with signs reading “Xenophobia hurts like apartheid” and “Mbeki their blood is on your hands” from Hillbrow to the CBD in an effort to impact the spectators. Evidence of its effectiveness, however, was not apparent. (Meadows 2009: 16-27) Boal maintains that “Words, in order to be symbols…need to be charged with the hopes, desires, needs and life experiences of each citizen.” Therefore, this expression may have released some of the tension even though it did not solve the larger problem. This may be why El Alaoui felt his Yeoville event was not effective in fighting xenophobia, yet the ability to express tensions and create connections among the youth are part of most carnivals, stimulating social cohesion which
may not be immediately apparent or easily quantified. Thus, while participation in the Joburg Carnivals has waned, the participation continues to produce positive feedback from the younger participants. As a child in the 2014 Joburg Carnival admitted, “I don’t have many friends. I come to make friends.”

Joburg Carnival

In 2002, Sack approached El Alaoui with a project to create a carnival in Hillbrow as a means to resolve problems with incidents of violence on New Year’s Eve. In addition to the high number of incidents related to alcoholism, drug use and crime, tenement residents would throw large items like old refrigerators off their balconies, falling as far as 16 stories, injuring or killing those on the streets below. Artists from ACC, CICI, Back Door Initiative (BDI) and the Bag Factory (artist studios in Newtown, now in Fordsburg) were invited to participate in the first Joburg Carnival on December 31, 2004. The City presented a theme and each region within Gauteng was tasked to create a subtheme. Design specifications reduced the amount of text and eliminated the use of any logos or names. Nkosana Ngobese, an artist with certificates in Fine Arts and Management from the Funda Community Training Centre in Soweto, felt this curbed creativity. Community leaders were instructed to devise themes around “a certain dialogue to communicate their region…like buildings, market, the landscape…what was sellable…trends in the future (figure 6).” For the 2014 Carnival, community leaders struggled with creating new themes; most were recycled from previous years. Creativity was clearly stifled under these constraints.

Figure 6

DACH officials, namely Ntabeni and Verrelli Dunellio Triegaardt, managed the budget and infrastructure. They organized the parade using the Sports and Recreation Centre managers to recruit artists and youth. They selected one or two artistic directors, choreographers and seamstresses for each troupe. Participants were bussed into town on the morning of the event and returned afterward. City mayors often provided opening speeches and sometimes walked in the procession. Marshals instructed troupes on placement within the procession. Each group carried a banner before their costumed performers and any floats, crafted in mas camps (figure 7). Food was provided in the morning and after the procession. The parade from Hillbrow to Newtown was followed by performances on stage at Mary Fitzgerald Square, where groups in later years competed for monetary prizes. Judges came from the arts community, but not from university faculty or Market Theatre. The entire process initially was given three months, then
six weeks, then three weeks, and in 2014, one week. Although a financial proposal is submitted in March and a budget is approved by June 30th for the upcoming Fiscal year (July-June), the Executive Director of Community Development at later and later stages has given final approval on the carnival budget. One or two months after the event, the City prepares a Final Report to assess the success of the carnival. Tensions are apparent between upper-level management, DACH organizers, and performers. Continual frustration with the policies, procedures and budgeting mark every parade. Attempts to change these policies have been rejected.

For the first carnival, Region 3 (Rosebank, Bryanston, Randburg, now part of Region B) created a spaceship costume to indicate that the future has no limits (figure 8). El Alaoui and Ngobese created three musical floats – the Gautrain, a “Vibe” float with dancers and a DJ, and a Shebeen-inspired float (figure 9). Artists Thabo Makholo, Pamela Xolane and Richard Plachy from Region 6 (Soweto, now Region D) created a costume in the shape of a yellow guitar to represent their music (figure 10). These floats and costumes reflected both the imagined past
and future. Pantsula dance groups wore delelas, or overalls; isbujwa dancers wore skinny jeans with white tackies; and hip-hop dancers donned baggy pants inspired by African-American performer M C. Hammer. This costume demonstrated the need for global connection. After the carnivals, the City dismantles the floats and stores some of the pieces and costumes at the Norwood Recreation Centre.

Social Cohesion

Organizers and participants consider the first carnival a great success. Artist Michelle Messias Nothnagel, who worked on Joburg Carnivals from 2004 to 2011 and again in 2014, stated: “It’s a fantastic atmosphere… the public, some of them are so overwhelmed at what’s going on… on the streets. The reaction just adds to the experience.” However, the triumph of the 2004 carnival as a deterrent to violence was mainly due to police activities and vigilance. They entered each tenement building in advance, informing residents about the parade and warning that they would raid the building if violence occurred. The goal of social cohesion was achieved by a combination of the threat by police and distraction via the parade spectacle.

In 2005, the unplanned appearance of costumes performed by African immigrants, or foreign nationals, met with mixed reactions. “They were a little bit out of order and overzealous.” The City wanted the organizers to include all City residents, including foreign nationals. Yet, without advance approval by officials, a possible “Nigerian spirit” in costume and mask appeared in the 2005 street parade spraying rum from its mouth (figure 11). This masquerader expressed the carnivalesque tendency to subvert the authorities and perform in socially unacceptable ways (spitting). Here was an occasion where a foreign African form was performed in a carnival atmosphere. Yet, none of the newspaper reports mentioned this character, nor did the city officials remember this costume. Thus, while some carnival organizers desire to include outsiders as a means to curb xenophobia, the unplanned and unapproved appearance of this figure, was ignored and forgotten. Spectators were surprised, amused or repelled. Humor is one of the tools performers use to invert meaning and voice protest, invoking the carnivalesque. In addition to dress, laughter and humor can remove the sting of everyday life. It can also bring greater awareness and participation from the spectators to the message of the performer or group. “Inverted meanings and sarcastic satire can surprise people and stimulate reflection.” (Bogad 2006: 53) The emphasis on collective and individual creativity, and free flowing multivocality, is often described as carnivalesque when paired with a theme of social or political protest. Humor with protest messages encourages all to enjoy and imagine other possible worlds. The strategy not only offers an alternate view, but a positive liberation from poverty and subjugation by authority. (Cohen 1993: 132)

Figure 11
Unknown Photographer, Masquerader, Joburg Carnival, December 31, 2005 (photograph courtesy of the City of Joburg: Arts, Culture & Heritage).
In an effort to broaden their knowledge and reduce xenophobia, DACH officials attended the Abuja carnival in Nigeria in 2012. Inspired, they invited foreign nationals in Johannesburg to participate wearing their cultural costumes in the 2012 Joburg Carnival. However, by 2012, these groups were afraid to participate due to their negative experiences with police and other officials. A few remained undaunted and wore costumes described by Triegaardt as “grass things with wooden masks.” These “spirits and funny things” repelled some of the more Christian participants who felt that “witchcraft and voodoo” themes, as they interpreted them, did not suit their religious beliefs. Though some may have found such performances unappealing, no violence erupted.

Political Critique

The 2012 carnival included another type of carnivalesque costume (figure 12). A performer from Alexandra (part of Region E) pulled a costume on wheels resembling a round of cheese with a section cut out. On top were houses representing Alexandra divided from the finer homes and skyscrapers by a train. Projecting from the top was a rainbow and a torch. According to Bridget van Oerle of Buz Publicity, the costume was “a dig at politicians because Alexandra had rat issues. [It] was like saying politicians were eating away at them.” The costume gave one of the most impoverished communities in Johannesburg a voice to comment on local government policies and neglect, yet at the same time reflect hopes for future development envisioned by the Gautrain, finer homes, rainbow and torch. Such carnivalesque inclusions are rare in the Joburg carnivals where flowers and other apolitical symbols are the norm.

Bodibe, who trained at the ACC, assisted with float making in the 2004 Joburg Carnival, and continued as a marshal from 2005 to 2009. In 2010, he joined The Giant Match, a paper mâché puppetry team funded by Gauteng Province, Institut Français South Africa (IFAS), and Les Grandes Personne (a French puppetry company). He assisted other artists at a workshop at Wits to create a set of oversized puppets and performed them in subsequent Joburg Carnivals and other events across the country (figure 13). He became the director of The Giant Match in 2010 after their successful performance at the FIFA World Cup opening ceremony.
In 2011, The Giant Match received special funding from the City to sponsor a paper mâché workshop. They created three new puppets representing Dr. Verwoerdt, Desmond Tutu and Winnie Mandela. These puppets serve to enforce historical narratives typical of heritage-themed parades. 2011 was a difficult carnival because rain threatened to cancel the event. However, spirits were high and the puppeteers hid the puppets underneath awnings for shelter. John Quinton Kieth George, who has worked on the Joburg Carnivals since 2004, remembered, “It started in sunshine, then it rained, but the kids kept dancing. They enjoyed it, even when the lightening came down.” George was promoted to work at the Region B Recreation Centre after initially volunteering on the Joburg carnivals. Previously a self-described, drug-selling gangster in Westbury, involvement in recreation centre programmes, like carnival, helped to change his life for the better.

Therefore, the Joburg Carnival has been successful in making a difference in some individuals’ lives. Spectators also enjoy the interaction with the Giant Match puppets along the route (figure 14). However, the results of increased social cohesion and the reduction of xenophobia have not measured up to the City’s expectations.

Figure 14
*Spectators and The Giant Match Puppets, Joburg Carnival, December 31, 2014* (photograph by author).

**The City Gets in Its Own Way**

Along the parade route, puppeteers from The Giant Match performed a shortened version of their play and later enacted its entirety on the stage in Mary Fitzgerald Square. This became problematic when the City asked for only half of the characters and insisted on a continuously moving parade. Taking the literal theatricality out of the parade curbed the potential unique character of these carnivals, demonstrating how the City stunts the carnivalesque in its own carnival.

One of the reasons City authorities perceive the carnival as unsuccessful is the more recent lack of participation that is tied to the purpose and politics underpinning the 12-year-old carnival. Numerous factors denote the active and passive rejection of the government-controlled event: 1) a lack of involvement from a diverse group of participants to meet social cohesion goals, 2) intermittent pay for artists and performers for their expertise and time has caused some to refuse to participate in future City events, 3) dissatisfaction with political and administrative leadership is deliberately exhibited by some of the performers, and 4) a lack of consistency is created by continual shifts in management and budget.
The lack of greater involvement from foreign nationals is due to fear of police brutality and other carnival restraints. Additionally, Ntabeni admits only about 2% of the children involved in Joburg Carnivals are white. “We don’t do enough [to recruit these children].” One of the issues with the New Year’s Eve time frame is the absence of children from wealthier, usually white, neighborhoods due to school closures and holiday trips. Also problematic is the fact that the carnival has more recently been dubbed as “a black carnival” due to the lack of diversity in participation and crowds. Increasing violence in the inner city has driven away the suburban white crowds and participants (figure 15).

![Figure 15](https://example.com/figure15.jpg)

*Figure 15*

*Participant Diversity, Joburg Carnival, December 31, 2005 (photograph courtesy of Michelle Messias Nothnagel).*

Payment of artists and performers is another issue. Two floats in the 2009 event addressed the upcoming FIFA World Cup (June-July 2010). Instead of sound trucks, performers used local instruments, such as the vuvuzela, brass horns and trombones, shake shakes (plastic bottles with stones inside) and drums. However, costume designs repeated those from the previous year probably because the same artists and concepts were utilized. Experienced artists complained...
that they weren’t being paid enough, and the lack of creativity may have been an act of passive resistance. Ngobese designed one of the floats with a globe displaying Africa at the front (figure 16a/b). A replica of the gold trophy and several oversized vuvuzelas topped the float. Some performers wore soccer jerseys and performers were instructed by the City to do the “Diski Dance,” a dance incorporating soccer-style kicking moves. Thus, the restrictive measures seem designed to create a propaganda piece used by government officials to target not only the South African audience but also an international one. Artists who were trained at CICI, such as Ngobese, Mandla Mdlulu, Monde Sphiwe Gama, and Vuyo Gope, a.k.a. Dada, were invited to work on the Joburg Carnivals; some years they were paid, some not. “I did it for free, for the love of it,” says Mdlulu of the 2009 carnival. Despite their passion for the event, artists, like doctors and lawyers, deserve to be paid for their expertise and labor (figure 17). Additionally, since 2010, the City decided to stop paying participants and offer prize money to the best groups for costumes, dancing, floats and theme interpretation. However, many of the prize-winning groups never received their monetary award, only the oversized faux check presented to them on stage and bragging rights. Such inconsistencies have bred discontent among artists and participants.

Financial inconsistencies have also plagued the Joburg Carnivals. The first carnival was organized by DACH with a budget of nearly R800,000. The budget was slightly larger in 2005. At this time, El Alaoui suggested to Sack that the City consider hiring a contractor to manage future carnivals. A three-year contract was awarded to the Carnival Consortium for 2006-2008; Ntabeni oversaw the Consortium comprised of Art Bouquet (Carmel Nair), Jimmy Jack Productions (Njabulo Jimmy Sibiya), and Mbonize Production House (Hlatshwayo). With consistent management and budgetary support of approximately R1,500,000/per year in place, the carnivals grew larger. Although the Consortium was tasked to secure private funding for partial support of the event and to design an infrastructure for future carnivals, it fell short of these aims. Monies were received in 2006 from the South African Police Service (SAPS), however according to the 2009 Final Project Report, “not many sponsors were particularly tantalized by the product that we had to offer as a vehicle to market their companies.” In 2009, the City contracted Jimmy Jack Productions. The City employed El Alaoui, and Sibiya as his assistant, to work as Artistic Director on the 2010 Joburg Carnival. Given only three weeks to complete the task, both men had little input on the final result. With a budget of nearly R2,000,000, several large floats were created to celebrate the FIFA World Cup. El Alaoui was disappointed with the project, for he felt “a lot of money was spent with little result.” In 2011, Sack left the department, and the anchor of carnival support in top management was lost. DACH continued to organize the 2011 and 2012 carnivals with a budget of R2,000,000 each. The 2013 carnival was merged with the Gauteng parade (the budget numbers were not provided). The carnival failed due to unfortunate timing and has not been attempted again. President Mandela died on the day before the carnival was held on December 6th, and his memorial service took place in the Johannesburg Athletic Stadium, previously planned to be the starting and ending point of the carnival. Since the route passed by Mandela’s memorial service, participants paraded in quiet observance. No one felt celebratory. Planned in advance, the lead float in the parade ironically included a large head of Mandela constructed in paper mâché.

In 2014, Ntabeni who had served as head coordinator of the carnivals for DACH since 2004, moved to another department. The director of the 2013 carnival was being audited for his possible mismanagement of carnival funds, so no director was in place for the 2014 event. Ntabeni was called in to assist with the carnival in the last two weeks, but was constrained by continual changes in budget and programming. The final budget for the carnival, as of December 17th, was R500,000. This budget was consistent with the 2015 carnival. The four groups who
performed in the 2014 Joburg Carnival were orphans from a home in Westbury (Region B), a dance troupe in Zulu-inspired costumes from Yeoville, orphans from the Twilight Children’s Home in Hillbrow and the Gihozo Rwandan Cultural Group from Hillbrow (Region F) (figure 18). Stilt walkers and several puppets from The Giant Match participated (figure 19). The 2015 event continued with the same number of participants. Therefore, by 2015, the carnival had been organized mainly by DACH, yet different directors within the administration had supervised the event and outside contractors had also been hired. No one seemed to meet the City’s expectations. The budget fluctuated and timing for preparation dwindled down to only one week.

Figure 18
Youth Group from the Twilight Home (Hillbrow), Joburg Carnival, December 31, 2014 (photograph by author).

Figure 19
Stilt Walker Lassie Ndalela, Joburg Carnival, December 31, 2014 (photograph by author).

Figure 20

Figure 21
Zoleka Ntabeni Performs a Costume from 2013, Joburg Carnival, December 31, 2014 (photograph by author).
These constraints are made apparent in two ways. Firstly, the lack of time creates lesser quality costumes in terms of visualizing the original design and concept. This is evinced through a comparison of a “Street Vendor” costume created for the Gauteng Carnival in 2005 (figure 20), with a costume created for the 2013 Joburg/Gauteng Carnival. It was performed in 2014 by Ntabeni despite its missing projections because of the lack of time to create new costumes (figure 21). Regardless of its condition, the conception of the costume is far simpler than the Street Vendor where the proportions are balanced with a large China bag carried on a backpack-style harness and a wide skirt made with colorful plastic plates in colors matching the tissue in the bag above. The plaid design of the bag is also repeated in the performer’s top. Since the same artists work on carnivals throughout South Africa, it is the lack of time and sometimes funding that creates this difference in quality.

Secondly, the lack of sponsorship also creates in-house budget issues. The Cape Town Carnivals are organized by a team of 17 individuals, mostly white, who secure funding from a variety of corporate sponsors in addition to the DACH and the City of Cape Town. Costumes and floats personally witnessed at the carnival held in Cape Town on March 14, 2015 (figure 22), were more elaborate and consistent in quality throughout the parade than those performed in the 2014 Joburg Carnival. The sponsors of this Cape Town Carnival included Vodacom, Coca-Cola and DSTV; companies with branches in Johannesburg. The obvious question is why these companies are willing to fund the carnival in Cape Town, but not the perceived “black” carnival in Johannesburg.

Disorganization and dissention between government control and organizers are hallmarks of Black Diaspora carnivals. Brazilian anthropologist Roberto DaMatta has investigated the dichotomy of carnivals that evolve around constructing a national identity and those programmed to highlight regional or local identities. The resulting drama may be planned “but are often uncontrolled.” (DaMatta 1991:27, 37-38) Intended as a political vehicle for social cohesion, many top Johannesburg officials hoped that Joburg Carnival parades would also draw revenue similar to those in Cape Town, Trinidad and Rio. One headline advertising the 2005 Joburg Carnival read “Eat Your Heart Out, Rio!” with a large color picture of one of the performers in costume. The caption stated “ANYTHING Rio de Janeiro can do, Joburg can do!” (NOVA November) While the parades have stimulated social cohesion and temporary job creation, they have failed to provide revenue. The perceived failure of the Joburg Carnival is intriguing as it comes at a time when several large cities around the Black Atlantic are adopting the Trinidad/Notting Hill model. (Ho 2005: 1-38) In Johannesburg, unlike the Caribbean, cultural hybridization, or the blending of elements from different cultures, is more or less a new phenomenon. Thus the Trinidad model, which celebrates this centuries-long history of cultural hybridity, may not suit the needs of Johannesburg residents. According to anthropologist Christine Ho, the hybridization was “manufactured through processes such as domination, resistance, accommodation, imitation, and hegemony, made possible by long histories of colonial entanglement between the powerful and the powerless.” (Ho 2005:29, 32) Using this definition, the model seems appropriate, however each area that adopts the model reshapes it for its city or region. Perhaps the young Joburg Carnival has not yet found its shape.
Despite these challenges, none of the black-centered, inner-city carnivals have lasted as long as the Joburg Carnival, now 12 years old. The carnival continues because the DACH administration finds value in the carnival and presses upon their superiors to fund the event. Finally in 2016, the Joburg Carnival was renewed with a budget of R2,500,000, and the local artists organized it with Jimmy Sibiya operating as the Artistic Director. For years the direct organizers, like Ntabeni and Triegaardt, have tried to encourage local artists to take a more active role in the carnival organization, yet the lengthy administrative process to register as a company for payment is a deterrent to the artists. Ntabeni reported that the event went well and “had new floats, large costumes and new troupe costumes and that is something we have not done since 2013.” However, the carnival needs more than a large budget. For the event to be its most effective, the carnivalesque must be allowed to surface in a carnival. Perhaps giving the artists more ownership will allow the carnivalesque to further the Joburg carnivals as an art form that better serves the needs of the inner-city communities.
Conclusion

While many claim the Joburg Carnival has been unsuccessful in meeting its goals of building social cohesion and deterring xenophobia, evidence exists for at least a moderate success. Much of this evidence was expressed through individual comments from the young participants, artists and spectators, rather than the organizers who enjoyed the event but expressed frustration with the administration. Though under acknowledged, some of the most successful moments of the inner-city carnivals often appeared in the greatest creative and carnivalesque costumes and expressions, including but not limited to, the Pieterson float in the ACC carnival, the spirit figures in the 2005 and 2012 Joburg Carnivals, and the cheese costume of the 2012 Joburg Carnival. Regarding the effort to decrease xenophobia, artist Thabo Mahomane stated, “From the carnival I had a different perspective. They [foreign nationals] are like any of us; they are our brothers and sisters, just basically looking for greener pastures. It [the carnival] was also a way of learning about their ways, their culture.”

According to Boal, without activist messages the theatrical interplay between actors and audience, or in carnival between participants and spectators, cannot occur. By attempting to remove the carnivalesque in fear of a protest march that may incite violence, the City administration doomed Joburg Carnival to be unpopular. Carnivals can be seen as an aesthetic means by which citizens can creatively express, negotiate and challenge hegemonic discourses and dispute racial injustice. Because of the partial success of the latest event, perhaps officials are learning to allow diversification in participation and greater range in expression.

Carnival is as much for the benefit and social change of the activists as it is for any spectator who will hopefully become spect-actors. The serious play is meant to inspire desire, collective, group cohesion, and identity formation – making a movement that has denser social networks and is more sustainable and adaptable through hard times. Even setbacks and misfires will be fed back into the creative process to help generate new ideas for the movement. (Bogad 2006: 56)

El Alaoui defines carnival as “an explosion of artistic expression by communities depicting their vision for the future, their aspirations and shared cultural heritage…united together to present different aspects of community to use art as a tool.” For a successful, long-term inner-city carnival, the community needs support to orchestrate and use carnival as a tool to voice their concerns in carnivalesque ways that activate participants and spectators, and offer therapeutic activism.

Notes

1 I wish to express my heartfelt thanks to all my interviewees for their generosity. I am grateful to DACH, especially Zoleka Ntabeni, for their cooperation and willingness to share their carnival archives. Additionally, I extend my appreciation to Kamal El Imam El Alaoui, Janet L. DeCosmo and John Nunley for their advice and encouragement with my manuscript. Thank you to Matshediso Radebe for providing the Zulu translation of my abstract. Zoleka Ntabeni, interview by author, January 28, 2015.

2 Benjy Francis, interview by author, February 2 and 26, 2015.

3 Artists work collectively on floats, yet Lucas Matome is credited with having designed the Pieterson float. Benjy Francis, interview by author, February 26, 2015; John Moltemo, interview by author, January 21, 2015.

4 Benjy Francis, interview by author, February 26, 2015.

Funding was provided initially by international embassies located in South Africa, yet by the 1990s, funding was mainly coming from international corporations, including Anglo American and De Beers. Benjy Francis, interview by author, February 2, 2015; Kamal El Imam El Alaoui, interview by author, January 7, 2015.

El Alaoui was born in Morocco and grew up in England. He attended college in both countries to study Fine Arts, but work took his attention away from graduating. He worked in London with Jim Henson’s Creature Shop and The Ovalhouse, a fringe theatre and arts centre. El Alaoui assisted with South Connections, a Notting Hill Carnival mas band based at The Ovalhouse by designing and making backpack costumes and floats. In 1989, former exile Eugene Skeef, composer, percussionist and poet, spearheaded anti-apartheid programmes at The Ovalhouse. Skeef, who had met Francis at the ACC while working on the Ngoma Project in 1993, recommended El Alaoui to him. Kamal El Imam El Alaoui, interview by author, January 7, 2015.


Many of the orphaned children come from as far away as Sierra Leone. Andries Kunene, interview by author, December 31, 2014.


The Caribbean term “mas” comes from masquerade. A mas camp is the area where the carnival costumes and floats are prepared.

Archives, DACH, Newtown, Johannesburg; Zoleka Ntabeni, interview, September 19, 2014; weekly meetings in November and December 2014, between the DACH and the managers of Sports and Recreation. Dudu Maseko, Executive Director for Community Development, refused an interview in 2015.

Verrelli Dunellio Triegaardt, interview by author, November 26, 2014.


Thabo Mahomane, interview by author, December 22, 2014. Tackies are canvas shoes with a rubber sole.

Michelle Messias Nothnagel, interview by author, November 27, 2014.


Thembinkosi Collen Hlatshwayo, interview by author, November 22, 2014.

Ibid.

Verrelli Dunellio Triegaardt, interview by author, November 26, 2014. No one had photographs of these performers.

Michelle Messias Nothnagel, interview by author, November 27, 2014.

Verrelli Dunellio Triegaardt, interview by author, November 26, 2014.


Oupa Bodibe, interview by author, January 6, 2015.

Ibid.

John Quinton Kieth George, interview, December 3, 2014.

Oupa Bodibe, interview by author, January 6, 2015.


Verrelli Dunellio Triegaardt, interview by author, November 26, 2014.

Ibid. A vuvuzela is a long horn made of plastic that can produce an ear-piercingly loud sound.

Thabo Makholo, interview by author, December 23, 2014.


Verrelli Dunellio Triegaardt, interview by author, November 26, 2014; Archives, DACH, Newtown, Johannesburg.


Ibid.

Verrelli Dunellio Triegaardt, interview by author, November 26, 2014.

Zoleka Ntabeni, interview by author, November 12, 2014.

Carnival meeting between the Departments of Arts, Culture and Heritage and the managers of Sports and Recreation, December 17, 2014. I failed to see R500,000 invested in the carnival witnessed December 31, 2014.

Mashico “Phillemon” Mokgesi, interview by author, January 12, 2015.

See the Cape Town Carnival website: http://capetowncarnival.com/organising-team/.

Ho discusses the myriad of carnivals in the diaspora that have been modeled after
the Trinidad Carnival. For an intriguing comparison, see Carlson 2010: 42-59.

Zoleka Ntabeni, e-mail message to author, January 17, 2017.

Verrelli Dunellio Triegaardt, interview by author, November 19, 2014. Sibiya had already registered during the period of the Consortium as Jimmy Jack Productions.

Zoleka Ntabeni, e-mail message to author, January 17, 2017.

Thabo Mahomane, interview by author, December 22, 2014.


Works cited


Courtney Micots (Ph.D., African Art History, University of Florida) is the Assistant Professor of Art History at Florida A & M University. Previously she was an Andrew W. Mellon Postdoctoral Research Fellow at Wits Art Museum, University of the Witwatersrand. She has taught at Florida Southern College, the University of Florida, the University of Illinois at Champaign-Urbana, the University of South Florida, Elon University, and for the Institute of African Studies at the University of Ghana in Legon. Recent publications include “Status and Mimicry: African Colonial Period Architecture in Coastal Ghana” in the March 2015 issue of the *Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians*, and “Carnival in Ghana: Fancy Dress Street Parades and Competition” in the spring 2014 issue of *African Arts*. She is currently authoring a book on Fancy Dress in Ghana. Her research focuses on resistance arts within architecture, carnival and textiles.